1. ROLL CALL

Present: Mayor Davis
        Councillor Antoski
        Councillor Utley
        Councillor Carpenter
        Councillor McCreary
        Councillor Wall
        Councillor Martin
        Councillor Weaver
        Councillor Sless
        Councillor Antoski

Regrets: Councillor Van Tilborg
         Councillor Vanderstelt

2. DECLARATIONS OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Councillor Weaver declared a pecuniary interest at 5:45 p.m. during a discussion regarding health and safety measures for municipal by-law officers as he is an Occupational Health and Safety Enforcement Officer with the Ministry of Labour and is required by his employer to declare a conflict with any matters that involve any legislative requirement that he enforces or any investigations involving the City and the Ministry of Labour. Accordingly, he refrained from all discussion.
3. ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

3.1 Continuation of 2020 Budget Worksheet

Joelle Daniels, Director of Finance provided a recap from the November 27, 2019 meeting.

Recap from previous night:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2020 Operating Budget*</td>
<td>$161,363,814</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Impact after Assessment Growth*</td>
<td>2.25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Residential Tax Impact*</td>
<td>1.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Residential Tax Increase*</td>
<td>$55.95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*all figures are prior to the capital levy. With the addition of the 0.75% capital levy, the average residential tax increase would be $79.49.

City-wide 2020 Capital Budget = $84,941,480
City-wide 2021-2029 Capital Forecast = $787,070,795

The chair indicated that Step 13.F was deferred from the November 25th meeting and requested that the representatives of the Community Physician Recruitment Committee provide an overview of their request.

Representatives from the Community Physician Recruitment Committee appeared before the committee and responded to various questions.

Return to Step 13.F – Community Physician Recruitment – Revised Funding Request (Deferred from November 25 meeting)

The City has received a revised funding request from the Community Physician Recruitment Program (Appendix A to tonight’s agenda) seeking approval to distribute the City’s 2020 grant in the following manner:

- Salary and Benefits - $48,000
- Recruitment Costs - $62,000

$110,000

Moved by Councillor Utley
Seconded by Councillor Vanderstelt

A. THAT the necessary agreement to support the 2020 contribution to the Community Physician Recruitment Program, in the amount of $110,000, include the following permitted uses of the City’s funds:

i. Recruiter Salary and Benefits - $48,000
ii. Recruitment Costs - $62,000; and
B. THAT the agreement between The Corporation of the City of Brantford and the Brant Community Healthcare System for the 2020 contribution to the Community Physician Recruitment Program BE PLACED on a signing bylaw for execution by the Mayor and Clerk.

Moved by Councillor Utley
Seconded by Councillor McCreary

THAT the following BE DEFERRED for one month:

A. THAT the necessary agreement to support the 2020 contribution to the Community Physician Recruitment Program, in the amount of $110,000, include the following permitted uses of the City’s funds:

i. Recruiter Salary and Benefits - $48,000
ii. Recruitment Costs - $62,000; and

B. THAT the agreement between The Corporation of the City of Brantford and the Brant Community Healthcare System for the 2020 contribution to the Community Physician Recruitment Program BE PLACED on a signing bylaw for execution by the Mayor and Clerk.

YES: (8): Mayor Davis, Councillor Weaver, Councillor Utley, Councillor Sless, Councillor McCreary, Councillor Martin, Councillor Antoski, and Councillor Wall

NO: (1): Councillor Carpenter

CARRIED (8 to 1)

Joelle Daniels, Director of Finance provided an overview of Steps 19.A and 19.B as follows:

19.A Information on the Corporate Financing Operating budget submission can be found beginning on Pg 219 of the Preliminary 2020 Operating Budget documents which were distributed electronically on November 8th. This document is also available online.

19.B The Corporate Financing 2020 Operating Budget, as presented, totals $19,556,726 and can be summarized as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DEPARTMENT/SERVICE</th>
<th>2019 NET BUDGET</th>
<th>2020 NET BUDGET</th>
<th>2019/2020 Variance</th>
<th>Percentage Variance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Debt Financing (Tax Supported)</td>
<td>3,608,417</td>
<td>3,726,191</td>
<td>117,774</td>
<td>3.26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital Financing (Tax Supported)</td>
<td>15,581,144</td>
<td>15,624,802</td>
<td>43,658</td>
<td>0.28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boundary Agreement</td>
<td>2,035,338</td>
<td>1,814,745</td>
<td>(220,593)</td>
<td>(10.84)%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supplementary Taxes/PILs/Adjustments on Taxes</td>
<td>(2,001,794)</td>
<td>(2,162,785)</td>
<td>(160,991)</td>
<td>(8.04)%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment Income</td>
<td>(3,513,000)</td>
<td>(4,100,000)</td>
<td>(587,000)</td>
<td>(16.71)%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current &amp; Retiree Benefits</td>
<td>2,303,110</td>
<td>3,280,110</td>
<td>977,000</td>
<td>42.42%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Utility Financing Revenues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(1,390,008)</th>
<th>(1,303,240)</th>
<th>86,768</th>
<th>6.24%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Insurance</td>
<td>2,964,949</td>
<td>2,817,003</td>
<td>(147,946)</td>
<td>(4.99)%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operating Budget</td>
<td>375,000</td>
<td>1,900,000</td>
<td>1,524,500</td>
<td>405.99%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contingency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL CORPORATE</strong></td>
<td><strong>$17,923,656</strong></td>
<td><strong>$19,556,726</strong></td>
<td><strong>$1,633,070</strong></td>
<td><strong>9.11%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The staff recommended budget reduction option included in the opening motion to transfer funds from the Accident Prevention Reserve to mitigate 2020 WSIB increases is not included in the numbers above, and has reduced the base budget by $1,500,000. This has reduced the overall Corporate Financing budget increase to 0.74%.

19.C Joelle Daniels, Director of Finance appeared before the Committee.

A PowerPoint presentation entitled “2020 Corporate Financing Operating budget” – was made.

A copy of the PowerPoint presentation will be placed in the Committee meeting file.

Joelle Daniels responded to various questions from Members of the Committee.

19.D **Other Budget Adjustments identified by the Committee**

The Chair indicated that motions from Members of the Committee would be required at this time to consider any other Corporate Financing budget increases or decreases.

No motions were made.

Joelle Daniels, Director of Finance provided an overview of Step 24.A as follows:

24.A **Base Budget Adjustments**

Since the distribution of the 2020 Budget documents, various information has been received by City staff, resulting in the need for the following increases or decreases to the Base 2020 Operating Budget:

- Final Insurance Premium Renewal for 2020 - $68,400
- MPAC Services for 2020 - $21,646
- County of Brant – 911 Service cost reduction – ($5,585)
- Clerk’s Office – Professional Services reduction - ($10,000)
- Non-Profit Housing Providers – Mortgage Renewal savings – ($30,420)
- Residential Tax Rebate ($50,000)
- Brantford Police Service ($102,000)

Additionally, Recreation staff has advised that there is no longer a need to undertake the Woodman Condition Assessment Capital Project-$50,000 (Ref no. 211) in 2020. The 2020 Capital Budget will be reduced accordingly.

The chart below reflects the impact of the above base budget adjustments:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2020 Operating Budget*</td>
<td>$161,255,855</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Impact after Assessment Growth*</td>
<td>2.18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Residential Tax Impact*</td>
<td>1.69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Residential Tax Increase*</td>
<td>$53.78</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*all figures are prior to the capital levy

City-wide 2020 Capital Budget = $84,891,480

24.B **Report Request re: By-law Enforcement**

At its September 24, 2019 meeting, City Council adopted the following:

A. THAT staff BE DIRECTED to report back to the Estimates Committee with proposals to increase the staff complement of the By-law Enforcement Division to allow for more efficiency in the areas of by-law enforcement; and

B. THAT staff BE FURTHER DIRECTED to ensure these proposals offer solutions, including but not limited to the creation of a stand-alone by-law department, wherein the by-law enforcement function can be self-sustaining from a cost recovery perspective.

The requested report, 2019-757, is attached to tonight’s eScribe agenda as Appendix B.

The Chair inquired if there was a mover and a seconder to put the item on the floor.

Moved by Councillor Wall
Seconded by Councillor Antoski

A. THAT Report 2019-757, Increase the Staff Complement of the By-law Enforcement Division of the Building Department, BE RECEIVED; and

B. THAT Staff BE DIRECTED to pursue option C as outlined in Report 2019-757; and

C. THAT Staff BE DIRECTED to review the By-law Enforcement Division and prepare a Report for the 2021 Budget process.

**Recorded Vote**

**YES:** (9): Mayor Davis, Councillor Weaver, Councillor Utley, Councillor Sless, Councillor McCreary, Councillor Martin, Councillor Carpenter, Councillor Antoski, and Councillor Wall

**CARRIED** (9 to 0)
24.C **Report Request – Concrete Crushing Tri-Annual Contract**

As part of the Nine-Year Capital Plan Review (2019-374) undertaken by the Estimates Committee in June 2019, the following direction to staff was approved by City Council:

**THAT Project 000154 – Concrete Crushing Tri Annual Contract BE REFERRED to staff for a report outlining the costs and revenue from the sale of concrete including the tipping fee revenue generated from the original receipt of concrete.**

The requested report, 2019-770 titled Tri-Annual Concrete Crushing Contract (Project #000154), Mohawk Street Landfill Site [Financial Impact – None], is attached to tonight’s eScribe agenda as Appendix C.

The Chair inquired if there was a mover and a seconder to put the item on the floor.

Moved by Councillor Carpenter
Seconded by Councillor Utley

A. **THAT report 2019-770, titled “Tri-Annual Concrete Crushing Contract (Project #000154), Mohawk Street Landfill Site”, BE RECEIVED; and**

B. **THAT Council APPROVE staff to continue to issue concrete crushing contracts on a tri-annual cycle through the capital program with financing obtained from the Landfill Reserve (i.e. non-tax supported) which will be partially funded by revenues from the sale of crushed materials.**

**Recorded Vote**

YES: (9): Mayor Davis, Councillor Weaver, Councillor Utley, Councillor Sless, Councillor McCreary, Councillor Martin, Councillor Carpenter, Councillor Antoski, and Councillor Wall

CARRIED (9 to 0)

24.D **Consideration of Unmet Needs**

Brian Hutchings, Chief Administrative Officer communicated to the committee that his office would like the opportunity to prioritize the below unmet needs before the committee considers the referred unmet needs.

Moved by Councillor Carpenter
Seconded by Councillor Weaver

**THAT Item 24.D Consideration of Unmet Needs BE DEFERRED to the December 9, 2019 Estimates Committee Meeting.**

**Recorded Vote**

YES: (8): Mayor Davis, Councillor Weaver, Councillor Utley, Councillor Sless, Councillor McCreary, Councillor Martin, Councillor Carpenter, and Councillor Antoski
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pg.</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION OF UNMET NEED</th>
<th>DEPT.</th>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
<th>2020 NET BUDGET IMPACT</th>
<th>INCREMENTAL NET 2021 BUDGET IMPACT</th>
<th>UNMET NEED APPROVED?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>24D.1</td>
<td>Asset Management Specialist</td>
<td>Corporate Initiatives &amp; Community Strategies</td>
<td>Mandatory</td>
<td>48,049</td>
<td>72,099</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.2</td>
<td>Housing Support Workers (2)</td>
<td>Social Assistance &amp; Homelessness</td>
<td>Risk to Public Safety</td>
<td>122,662</td>
<td>43,750</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.3</td>
<td>Increased Hours for Security Guard</td>
<td>Library</td>
<td>Risk to Public Safety</td>
<td>18,700</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.4</td>
<td>Human Resources Representative</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>Staff Recommended</td>
<td>95,371</td>
<td>30,201</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.5</td>
<td>Landscape Architect</td>
<td>Parks</td>
<td>Staff Recommended</td>
<td>82,264</td>
<td>23,420</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.6</td>
<td>Third Party Disability Specialist</td>
<td>Human Resources</td>
<td>Staff Recommended</td>
<td>50,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.7</td>
<td>Continuous Improvement Project Manager (3 Year Contract)</td>
<td>Public Works Administration</td>
<td>Staff Recommended</td>
<td><strong>Net $0</strong> ($96,964 gross funded from capital)</td>
<td><strong>Net $0</strong> ($23,455 gross funded from capital)</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.8</td>
<td>Design Technologist</td>
<td>Engineering Services</td>
<td>Staff Recommended</td>
<td><strong>Net $0</strong> ($83,485 gross funded from capital)</td>
<td><strong>Net $0</strong> ($20,186 gross funded from capital)</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.9</td>
<td>Fire Safety Educator</td>
<td>Fire</td>
<td>Staff Recommended</td>
<td>61,966</td>
<td>19,433</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.10</td>
<td>Addiction Support</td>
<td>Social Assistance &amp; Homelessness</td>
<td>Staff Recommended</td>
<td>165,105</td>
<td>2,292</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.11</td>
<td>New Sponsor Development Contract Position</td>
<td>Sanderson</td>
<td>Staff Recommended</td>
<td>28,178</td>
<td>22,969</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.12</td>
<td>Intermediate Planner – Development Planning</td>
<td>Planning</td>
<td>Response to Direction from Council</td>
<td>63,109</td>
<td>56,840</td>
<td>Yes  No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.13</td>
<td>87</td>
<td><strong>Value for Money Audit</strong></td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Response to Direction from Council</td>
<td><strong>Net $0</strong></td>
<td>($100,000 gross funded from Council Priorities Reserve)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.14</td>
<td>30</td>
<td><strong>eScribe Live Streaming of Council &amp; Committee Meetings</strong></td>
<td>Communications &amp; Community Engagement</td>
<td>Response to Direction from Council</td>
<td>25,900</td>
<td>(4,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.15</td>
<td>199</td>
<td><strong>Transportation Planning Coordinator</strong></td>
<td>Engineering Services</td>
<td>Response to Direction from Council</td>
<td><strong>Net $20,459</strong></td>
<td>($79,316 gross remainder funded from capital)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.16</td>
<td>218</td>
<td><strong>Interim Measure to Improve Traffic Flow to/from Hwy 403 and West Brant</strong></td>
<td>Operational Services</td>
<td>Response to Direction from Council</td>
<td>14,000</td>
<td>(14,000)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24D.17</td>
<td>204</td>
<td><strong>Retrofit Pedestrian Signal at Colborne Street West and Fire Station #4</strong></td>
<td>Engineering Services</td>
<td>Response to Direction from Council</td>
<td>21,000</td>
<td>(21,000)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Moved by Mayor Davis  
Seconded by Councillor McCreary

Motion to Recess until Monday December 9, 2019.

Recorded Vote

YES: (8): Mayor Davis, Councillor Weaver, Councillor Utley, Councillor Sless, Councillor McCreary, Councillor Martin, Councillor Carpenter, and Councillor Antoski

CARRIED (8 to 0)

4. **RECESS TO RECONVENE AT 4:30 P.M. ON MONDAY, DECEMBER 9, 2019**

The meeting was recessed at 6:09 p.m. to reconvene at 4:30 p.m. on December 9, 2019.

_______________________________  __________________________________
Councillor Martin, Chair  C. Gauthier, Deputy Clerk/Manager, Legislative Services